

MINUTES OF THE PUBLIC HEARING IN RESPECT OF PROPOSED 58 NO'S OF SAND BELTS MINING (MINOR MINERAL) IN PARBHANI, MANWAT, SELU, GANGAKEHED, PURNA, SONPETH, PALAM, PATHRI & JINTUR TALUKAS OF PARBHANI DISTRICT PROPOSED BY COLLECTOR OFFICE, PARBHANI, MAHARASHTRA HELD AT COLLECTOR OFFICE, PARBHANI ON 01/02/2024, AT 11:00 AM.

.....

The public hearing in respect of proposed 58 sand belts mining (minor mineral) in Parbhani, Manawat, Selu, Gangakhed, Purna, Sonpeth, Palam, Pathri and Jintur Talukas of Parbhani District, proposed by Collector Office, Parbhani, Maharashtra was conducted on Thursday, the 1st February, 2024 at 11:00 a.m. at Collector Office, Parbhani, Tal. & Dist. Parbhani, Maharashtra.

As per the Notification dated 14-09-2006 issued by Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India, (MoEFCC, GoI), New Delhi and subsequent amendment on 01-12-2019, Member Secretary, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Mumbai has constituted Public Hearing Panel vide Office Order No. E -97 of 2024 issued under letter no.BO/JD (WPC)/PH/B - 240101-FTS-0253, Dated 01-01-2024.

The committee members present during the Public Hearing are as under-

1. **Raghunath Gawade,** : Chairman
District Magistrate, Parbhani _
2. **Sujit Dholam,** : Member
Regional Officer,
M.P.C.Board,
Chhatrapati Sambhajinagar.
3. **Shripad Kulkarni** : Convener
Sub-Regional Officer,
M.P.C.Board, Parbhani

Shri S.R. Kulkarni, Sub Regional Officer, MPCB, Parbhani and Convener of the Public Hearing Committee welcomed Hon'ble Chairman, Other Government Officials and other participants who were present and with permission of District Magistrate, Parbhani and Chairman of the Public Hearing Committee started the proceeding of public hearing.

Shri S.R. Kulkarni briefed about background of the objective of public hearing in brief and said that as per the EIA Notification of Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India, (i.e. MoEFCC, GoI) dated 14th September, 2006 as amended on 1st December, 2009, it is mandatory to conduct prior public consultation to certain projects which are covered in the schedule of the said Notification.

Shri S.R. Kulkarni informed that Project Proponent District Mining Officer, Collector Office, Parbhani, proposed 58 no's Sand Belt Mining (Minor Mineral) in Parbhani, Manawat, Selu, Gangakhed, Purna, Sonpeth, Palam, Pathri and Jintur Talukas of Parbhani District, for conducting Public Hearing to Maharashtra Pollution Control Board. Accordingly, as per

said Notification, 30 days' advance public notice was published in the local newspaper Daily "Sakal" in Marathi and in national newspaper in "The Times of India" in English on 31st December 2023. The public were asked to send their suggestions or objections regarding the proposed sand Ghats.

Convener of the Public Hearing Committee informed that the aim of conducting prior public consultation is to make aware, local people who can be participant in the hearing and they should know the developmental activities and Environment Management Plan of the unit.

As per the Notification of Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Govt. of India (MoEFCC, GoI), the copies of detail information of Environment Management Plan (EMP) and Executive Summary of the proposed sand belts in English and in Marathi (local language) were made available at following notified Government offices-

- District Collector, Parbhani.
- Zilha Parishad, Parbhani.
- District Industries Centre, Parbhani.
- Tahsil Office, Parbhani, Manwat, Selu, Gangakhed, Sonpeth, Purna, Palam, Jintur & Pathri, Dist. Parbhani.
- Grampanchayat Office- Wangi, Rajura, Takali Nilwarne, Sawangi Magar, Kothala, Shevadi Jahagir, Ramprui [Bu], Pardi Takli, Tal. Manwat, Nandgaon [Kh.], Tal. Parbhani, Sategaon, Devthana, Mithapur, Dhangar Takli, Kantheshwar, Wazur, Kharbada, Pimpalgaon Sarangi, Nila, Kankheda, Mamdapur, Suki, Pimpalgaon [Ba], Sandalapur, Tal. Purna, Sawali [Bu], Nilaj, Ganeshnagar, Wazar [Bu], Pimpalgaon Gayake, Tal. Jintur, Mahatpuri, Gaudgaon, Chinchtakli, Muli, Dharkhed, Zola, Masala, Nagthana, Tal. Gangakhed, Khadgaon, Sonna, Digras [Bu], Ambegaon [Di], Tal. Selu, Rahati, Phala, Raorajur, Dhanewadi, Arkhed, Pharkanda, Barbadi, Sawangi Thadi, Pimpalgaon [Mu], Sawangi [Bhu], Gunj, Bhogaon, Dutka, Tal. Palam, Khadka/Mohala, Lasina, Thadi Pimpalgaon, Tal. Sonpeth, Daku Pimpri, Tq. Pathri Sub-Regional Office, Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Parbhani.
- Sub Regional Office, M.P.C.Board, 1st floor, Devkrupa Building, Nandkheda Road, Parbhani.
- Regional Office, M.P.C. Board, Plot No. A-4/1, MIDC Chikalthana Chatrapati Sambhajinagar.
- Maharashtra Pollution Control Board, Kalpataru Point, 2nd, 3rd & 4th Floor, Sion Matunga Scheme Road No. 8, Shiv (E), Mumbai – 400 022.
- Environment Department, Government of Maharashtra, 15th Floor, Madame Cama Road, Mantralaya, Mumbai-32.
- Regional Office, Ministry Environment, Forest & Climate Change, (WCZ), Ground Floor, East Wing, New Secretariat Building, Civil Lines, Nagpur.

Shri S.R. Kulkarni, Sub Regional Officer, MPCB, Parbhani and Convener of the Public Hearing Committee further appealed to the present participants to raise environmental related suggestion or objection if any in writing as well as orally and requested to ask questions regarding environment only so that satisfactory answer/clarification can be given by project proponent or their technical consultant. It will be noted in minutes of public hearing and along with video recording of the proceeding will be submitted to department of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Maharashtra Government Mumbai for further process.

Convener of the Public Hearing Committee requested to Environment Consultant of the project to start the technical presentation on the Environment Management Plan and other project details in local language.

According to that, Ms. Vaishnavi Ramteke representing Project consultant M/s Mahabal Enviro Engineers Pvt .Ltd. presented details of Proposed of sand sand ghats, mining plan, environment Management Plan, etc. by power point presentation. She further stated that as per Govt. rules public hearing is mandatory for minor minerals for sand mining on 0-to-05-hectare area. For prior environmental clearance public hearing is an important step.

In proposed sand mining project opencast mining will be done manually with the help of tools like shovel and Sweaty. Excavated sand will loaded in tractor trolley and sand will be transported to depot by tractor trolley only. Sand mining may cause impact on water, Air, Land, Biodiversity, Social economy, Plan for mitigation of such impact is as follows.

To avoid impact on land, mining will be done as per mining plan and on permitted area only. To control water pollution sand mining will be done on dry river bed only, mining will not be done in monsoon so that sand will be replenished, mobile toilet will be provided to the labours, excavation will be done for 1.5 to 2.0 meter only as per availability of sand, to prevent air pollution water sprinkling will be done on sand ghats as well as transportation roads. Plantation will be done along the roads and near villages to prevents particulate pollution. Mining will be done during daytime only to control noise pollution apart from this mining will be carried out on dry river bed by which there will be no impact on aquatic life. It will be overall ensured that no adverse impact will occur on the environment.

Details of proposed sand belts are as follows-

Taluka Parbhani -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Nandgaon Khurd	362,363,368,370,371, 372	500x40x2.50	2.00	4028

Taluka Manavat -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Wangi	12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 08, 09, 10, 51, 52, 53, 54	700x60x1.00	4.20	7420
2	Rajura	1, 2	650x16x1.00	1.04	2261
3	Takli Nilwarn	176, 177, 178, 180, 190, 191, 206/1, 206/2, 207, 210, 211;	500x20x0.50	1.00	1767
4	Sawangi Magar	1, 2, 9, 13, 14, 171,	500x20x0.50	1.0	1767
5	Kothala	195, 196, 151, 197,	400x25x0.50	1.0	1413.42
6	Shevdi Jehangir	71 and 79, 81, 83, 84, 90;	500x20x0.50	1.0	1767
7	Rampuri bu	454, 455, 458, 459, 468, 474, 475, 478, 479, 480;	900x50x1.00	4.50	7951
8	Pardi Takli	35, 36, 45, 46, 47, 49, 51, 52, 53, 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97;	500x20x0.50	1.0	1767

Taluka Purna -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Sategaon	4 8 , 55,54,53,52,51	340x50x0.50	1.70	3003
2	Devthana	76, 167, 168, 169, 170	295x93x1.00	2.74	4847
3	Mithapur	15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20	350x55x1.00	1.92	3401
4	Dhangar Takli	8, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 21, 22, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 31, 32, 36, 39, 40	400x45x1.00	1.80	3180
5	Kantheswar	3, 186, 187, 217, 221	200x55x1.00	1.10	1554
6	Wazur	228, 232, 236, 242, 246,	400x65x1.00	2.60	4593
7	Kharbda	246 and 250, 242, 240, 229, 234;	375x65x1.00	2.43	3445
8	Pimpalgaon Sarangi	20, 21, 22, 117, 112, 111, 110, 108, 102, 101, 97;	345x55x1.00	1.89	3352
9	Nila	81, 73, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 16, 17, 23, 24, 27	550x60x0.70	3.30	2915
10	Kanadkhed	698, 699, 700, 715, 552, 543, 542, 541, 324, 329, 325, 230, 232, 233, 1, 8, 9	630x60x1.00	3.78	6678
11	Mamdapur	14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20, 21	260x50x100	1.30	2500
12	Suki	155, 156, 192, and 197;	800x45x1.00	3.60	3180
13	Pimpalgaon Ba.	144, 149, 136, 133, 150 and 156 192 and 196	800x50x1.00	4.00	7067
14	Sandalapur	6, 7, 8, 9, 10,	500x50x1.00	2.50	2208

Taluka Jintur -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Sawli Bu	62,63,64,70,71,97	200x50x2.50	1	1766
2	Nilaj	16,18,20,22,25,26	200x50x1.50	1	1766
3	Ganesh Nagar	6,47,48,49,50,51,1,	200x50x2.50	1	1766
4	Vazar Bu	466,467,468,469,470,475,476,477,480	250x50x2.00	1.25	30000
5	Pimpalgaon Gayke	300,301,302,303,304,313,315,316	440x25x2.50	1.10	1943

Taluka Gangakhed -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Anandwadi under Mahatpuri	268, 270, 271, 272,	700x60x0.50	4.25	6100
2	Mahatpuri	4, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 12, 15, 16, 17,	430x48x0.50	2.06	3600
3	Goudgaon	55 and 59,	500x40x0.50	2.0	3534
4	Chinch Takli	40 and 43, 50 and 52, 45, 46, 49	650x48x0.50	3.12	5512
5	Muli	399, 401, 402, 205, 206, 209, 410, 413, 414, 415, 417, 423	305x40x0.50	1.22	2155
6	Dharkhed	14 to 16, 8 to 11	415x40x0.50	1.66	2900
7	Zola	9 to 12, 14, 15	457x40x0.50	1.83	3230
8	Masla	51, 52, 56, 57, 64	675x44x0.50	2.97	5247
9	Nagthana	110, 113, 115, 118, 123, 133, 134, 153, 155,	565x49x0.50	2.78	4891

Taluka Selu -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Khadgaon	16, 17,	250x55x2.10	1.37	354
2	Sonna	155, 158	300x40x2.15	1.20	531
3	Digras Bu.	1,2,3,4,5,10,1	500x20x2.10	1	833
4	Ambegaon Digar	83,84,87,88,89	250x40x2.30	1	1062

Taluka Palam -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Rahati	22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27,	500x50x2.50	2.00	4000
2	Phala	1, 81, 86, 88, 89, 110	360x30x2.50	1.08	10000
3	Ravarajur	1, 9, 10, 11, 22, 23, 28, 29, 30	490x100x2.50	4.90	4300
4	Dhanewadi	23, 24, 29, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5,	500x80x2.50	4	290
5	Arkhed	445, 446, 450, 452	400x100x2.50	4	4000
6	Farkanda	29, 28, 27, 24, 23	500x30x2.50	1.50	5400
7	Barbadi	3,4,5	350x30x2.50	1.05	3100

8	Savangi thadi	1,2, 7, 8, 22	400x40x2.50	1.60	7000
9	Pimpalgaon Mu.	94,95,98	400x60x2.50	2.40	7000
10	Savangi Bhu.	100 and 104, 106 and 110, 119, 121 and 123, 132	500x100x2.50	5	6600
11	Gunj	44, 45, 50, 51, 52, 1,9, 10, 11, 19, 27,	800x50x2.50	4.4	5000
12	Bhogaon	7, 9, 10, 11, 22, 23, 28, 29,	500x50x2.50	2.50	4000
13	Dutka	1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 10, 11, 12, 16, 17, 31, 32, 35, 36,	1000x50x2.50	5	8000

Taluka Sonpeth -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Khadka/ Mohala	4, 5, 6, 1, 23, 20, 19, 17, 16	750x40x2.75	3	7951
2	Lacina	260, 262, 263, 264, 270, 271, 279, 275, 278, 279, 300, 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 13, 15, 37, 51, 52, 54	950x30x2.50	2.85	5035
3.3	Thadi Pimpalgaon	1, 6, 15, 17, 18, 19, 131, 132, 133, 134, 135, 136, 137, 129, 130, 126, 158, 141, 140,	500x90x2.50	4.50	7951

Taluka Pathari -

Sr. No.	Name of Sand Ghat	Survey No.	Area (LxWxD)	Area in Hectare	Sand availability (Brass)
1	Daku Pimpri	145, 144, 141, 140,	500x40x1.00	2	7500

All above information recorded in CD (soft copy) and noted in public hearing minutes.

After technical presentation, Shri S.R. Kulkarni, Sub Regional Officer, MPCB, Parbhani and Convener of the Public Hearing Committee appealed participants to raise the suggestions or objections regarding the Environment Management Plan of the Sand Belt Mining (Minor Minerals) with their Name, resident village name.

Following persons participated in the discussions and the Answers given by the Project Proponent / Project Consultant / Public Hearing Committee: -

Balasaheb Khope, Gunj Khurd, Pathari, Dist. Parbhani

Whether sand mining in river basins is environmentally friendly? Sand mining agencies not paying attention to the environment, environmental management, planting of trees, and enforcement of regulations.

District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,

The bidding of sand ghat will be done only after obtaining environmental clearance and sand will be excavated as per rules prescribed in environmental clearance. Water will be sprinkled up to one kilometer to maintain the environmental balance and trees will be planted on both sides of the road where the sand is transported.

Digambar Nivruti Kadam, Thadi Pimpalgaon, Tal. Sonpeth, Dist. Parbhani

Though the Thadi Pimpalgaon Gram Panchayat rejected the resolution in the Gram Sabha to excavate sand from the riverbed, still sand ghat has been put up for auction. Also, there is no drinking water facility in this village, the water supply well is in the riverbed, after the start of sand mining, the issue of drinking water will become serious. Village road gets damaged by sand transporter after sand mining starts, School children, various types of patient journeys difficulties will increase. Administration is earnestly requested to cancel the auction process of sand ghats.

District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,

A Gram Panchayat resolution was taken for the proposed Sand ghat, which was rejected by the Gram Panchayat. As per the provisions of the Government Rules, the Gram Sabha under the chairmanship of the concerned Sub-Divisional Officer has called for a re-resolution and accordingly the Ghat has been included. It is requested to give memorandum to collector office regarding facilities such as roads, water supply, clinics, etc., accordingly works can be done from the District Mineral Establishment Fund. Decision on demand for funds will be taken as per recommendation of Tehsil Office and the Technical Committee, after examining all the matters.

Kishan Deshmukh, Gram Sevak , Mohla, Sonpeth Dist. Parbhani

After the auction, the village road should not be used for sand transport, since the road work has been done recently, an alternative road should be used or it is the demand of the villagers that the alternate road should be used .

District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,

If you have something to say, you should give in to the Collector's Office/District Mining Office so that an alternative route can be explored.

District Collector, Parbhani said that,

After auction of sand ghat alternate road or shivarasta will be made available for sand transportation also precaution need to be taken that the sand will not be transported from the village roads.

Ramkishan Dhotre, Sankalp Vikas Sanstha, Gunj Khurd, Ta. Pathari Dist. Parbhani.

Illegal sand mining of about thousand's of brass is going on from Godavari River at Gunj kh but no one is paying attention. If sand is not auctioned, what do you have to say about it? A letter also has been given to administration regarding villagers are not getting sleep at night due to illegal sand mining and transportation.

District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,

Intention of this public hearing is to stop illegal sand mining. The public hearing is organized for the auction process to be done as soon as possible. After the public hearing on environmental issues and after getting the approval of the environment department, as soon as possible, we will take action to approve the auctions. When 58 retighats are officially started in Parbhani district, other malpractices will be controlled and also action is going on everywhere in the district through the collector office team and the Taluka level team to stop

illegal mining. If there is complaint, our team ready and will be sent for investigation/action After this if you have any complaint you should put it in writing and if letter is given accordingly.

Govind Babasaheb Magar, Sarpanch, Sonna Tal Selu Dist. Parbhani

In the year 2021-2022 , the sand ghat has been already auctioned and one more sand ghat has been proposed for auction in this year. We have no objection to the auction, but after the auction, the sand will be transported from village road which will damage existing road therefor requested to use alternate road. Now road constrction work from pati to village road will start soon. So it is further requesteed instead of using the existing road Ambegaon Shiwar, Goglegaon Shiwar or Shivshiwar road may be used. No fund was received from the collector office against the sand ghat auction held in the year 2021-2022 .

District Collector, Parbhani said that,

In DMF amount depositewd was less and demands from the people is more. So a district level meeting was held regarding allocation of fund and accordigly proposal of the scheme has been sent to the government. We have the funds but as soon as possible after getting approval from the government fund will be distributed.

Viththal Salve , Sankalp Vikas Sanstha, Gunj Khurd, Ta. Pathari Dist. Parbhani.

In proposed 58 sand ghats in Prbhani district it has been stated that sand mining will be carried out manually using hand tools as per criteria prescribed by the government. But actually sand mining is carried out by using JCB machine and even in night time also secondally it has to be carried out on dry riverbed only but it observed that sand is excavated from riverbed having water using various boats. Transportation of Sand supposed to done by covered vehicles but actually it is carried openly. The sand ghats which have been auctioned earlier are expected to carryout plantation to maintain the balance of the environment but not planted. Therefor it is expected that atleast minimum rules will be followed during course of sand mining so that purpose of this public hearing will be fruitfull.

District Collector, Parbhani said that,

After sunset the sand Excavation and transportation is not allowed and to have control on the same we are proposing to constitute village level vigilance committees. As, Talathi and Circle officers have multiple villages under their jurisdiciton, unable to control illegal sand excavation timely. Hence village level vigilance committees consisting of Sarpanch, Police Patil, Villagers, etc. to take immediatly action for control illegal sand mining even at night time. It is expected that aproprate cooperation will be extended by all villages regarding the same.

Manik Sheshrao Kadam, Thadi Pimpalgaon, Tal. Sonpeth, Dist. Parbhani

Whether Sand ghat can be auctioned without Gram Panchayat resolution? Our Grampanchayt has not passed resolution for auction of sand ghat evenafter sand ghat has been proposed for auction by District mining office.

District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,

A Gram Panchayat resolution was taken for the proposed Sand ghat, which was rejected by the Gram Panchayat. As per the provisions of the Government Rules, the Gram Sabha under the chairmanship of the concerned Sub-Divisional Officer has called for a resolution and accordingly the Ghat has been included, requested to give written memorandum so that further decision will be taken after verification.

Sarpanch, Mohala Tal. Sonpeth Dist. Parbhani said,

Sand ghat within the limits of village Mairal Sawangi Tal. Gangakhed has been auctioned but sand is being excavated from the river bed in the limits of village Mohala therefore it is requested to demark boundries of sand ghat between two sand ghats of village Mairal Savangi and Mohala.

District Collector, Parbhani said that,

Team will be deputd for demakation as requested.

Nandkumar Manikrao Choudhari, Sarpanch, Wangi, Tal. Manwat Dist. Parbhani

It is requested to provide rules and criteria for sand mining procedure to the Gram Panchayat so that we can refer the same in future. Pls provide information regarding proposed location of sand depot. It is general practice that, depth of excavated river bed is not measured by authorities.

Sub Regional officer M.P.N.Mandal , Parbhani by said that ,

Copies of Environmental Mangamnet Plan and it's executive summary in english and marathi has been made available to all concerned Gram Panchayat Offices, before 30 days of this public hearing.

Also **District Mining Officer, Shri Suresh Gholve said,**

Sand depots will be within the limits of the concerned Gram Panchayat as per availability on private or Government owned land. The auction process will be done according to the available sand qunatity. A copy of the environmental clearance will be given to the Gram Panchayat. Also, a team with Engineer will be deputed by Collector Office for inspection of sand ghats and measurement of excvation done for sand.

Venkat Gite, Sarpanch, Dakupimpri, Tal. Pathari Dist. Parbhani

No fund has been received from the collector office against the auction of ghat held last year i.e. 2021-2022 proposal has been submitted already for the same.

District Collector, Parbhani said that,

In DMF amount depositewd was less and demands from the people is more. So a district level meeting was held regarding allocation of fund and accordigly proposal of the scheme has been sent to the government. We have the funds but as soon as possible after getting approval from the government fund will be distributed. It seems all have presented their views we can conclude the proceedings.

Sub Regional officer, M.P.C. B. Parbhani said that ,

According to the advertisement given in the newspaper, a letter from V. Sunanda Reddy, Nalgonda, Telangana has been received through e-mail dated 31-01-2024 which has put up before public hearing committee for consideration.

Further, he once again appealed to the participants to put up suggestions or objections if any. But there was no any response from the participants. Therefore, Convenor extended thanks to all participants for attending the public hearing and with the permission of chair delared that proceeding of the said hearing has been concluded with thanks to the chair.



(Shripad Kulkarni)

Convener,
Public Hearing Committee
And
Sub Regional Officer,
Maharashtra Pollution
Control Board, Parbhani



(Sujit Dholam)

Member,
Public Hearing Committee
And
Regional Officer,
Maharashtra pollution
Control Board,
Chatrapati Sambhajinagar



(Raghunath Gawade)

Chairman,
Public Hearing Committee
And
District Magistrate, Parbhani