

MINUTES OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL PUBLIC HEARING HELD IN RESPECT OF M/S. APPASAHEB NALAWADE GADHINGLAJ TALUKA SAHAKARI SAKHAR KARKHANA LTD., AT HARALI, TAL: GADHINGLAJ, DIST. KOLHAPUR, (MAHARASHTRA STATE) FOR PROPOSED EXPANSION OF SUGAR CANE CRUSHING CAPACITY FROM 2000 TCD TO 5500 TCD, DISTILLERY BASED ON 'C' / 'B' HEAVY MOLASSES/ SUGARCANE JUICE/CONCENTRATED SUGARCANE JUICE CAPACITY FROM 25 KLPD TO 200 KLPD AND 200 KLPD PRODUCTION OF RECTIFIED SPIRIT/E.N.A./ETHNOL

An environmental public hearing in respect of M/s. Appasaheb Nalawade Gadhinglaj Taluka Sahakari Sakhar Karkhana Ltd., At Harali, Tal: Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur, (Maharashtra State) was held for proposed expansion of Sugar Cane Crushing Capacity From 2000 TCD To 5500 TCD, Distillery Based On 'C' / 'B' Heavy Molasses/ Sugarcane Juice/Concentrated Sugarcane Juice Capacity From 25 KLPD To 200 KLPD And 200 KLPD Production Of Rectified Spirit/E.N.A./Ethanol on 09-08-2023 at 11.30 am at factory site at Tubular Godown Area of the factory, village Harali, Tal: Gadhinglaj, Dist: Kolhapur.

The following panel members were present during the meeting.

1. **Shri Sanjay Teli, :**
Resident Deputy Collector &
Additional District Magistrate, Kolhapur.
(Representative of Hon. District Collector)

Chairman

2. **Shri. Jagannath S. Salunkhe, :**
Regional Officer,
MPC Board, Kolhapur
(Representative of MPC Board)

Member

3. **Shri. Pramod R. Mane, :**
Sub Regional Officer,
MPC Board, Kolhapur.

Convener.

In the beginning Shri Pramod R. Mane, Sub regional Officer, MPCB Kolhapur cum Convener of this Environmental public hearing welcomed all public present for public hearing and started meeting with permission of the Chairman. He stated that the project proponent has submitted a proposal to the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change for the proposed project. Accordingly, MOEFCC has granted them TOR on 23/03/2023 with certain terms and conditions. He continues that Today's public hearing

is conducted as a part of the TOR. As per Environmental Impact Assessment Notification 2006 and amended there to notice regarding this public hearing was given on 06.07.2023 in local newspapers in Marathi and English languages. Also the copies of EIA report were kept for a month for study of the public at The District Collector, Collector office, Kolhapur; The General Manager, District Industries Centre, Kolhapur; The CEO, Zilla parishad Kolhapur; Environment & Climate change Department, 15th floor, Madam Cama Marg, Mantralaya Government of Maharashtra; Head Office of MPC Board, Sion, Mumbai; The SDO, SDO office, Gadhinglaj; The Tahsildar, Tahasil Office, Gadhinglaj; Gram Panchayat, Harali & Khurd, Panchayat Samiti Office Harali & Khurd, Gadhingla. Also as per the notification requested the public to submit their objections, suggestions etc. regarding the proposed project in local newspaper in Marathi & English. In continuation to this Shri Pramod Mane, Sub Regional Officer told that first of all the environmental consultant of the project proponent will show presentation regarding the proposed project, the people should watch it peacefully and thereafter should raise any doubts, questions, objections, suggestions etc. by mentioning their name and place, public can also submit written representations. All the proceedings will be recorded, and the minutes of the public hearing will be sent to the government for further decision. This environmental public hearing committee does not take any decisions regarding permission for the project as the final decision will be taken by MOEFCC.

Thereafter, Shri Sanjay Teli, Chairman of the public hearing committee cum Resident Deputy Collector, Kolhapur informed that we would record all the proceedings of the meeting as it is and will submit the Minutes of public hearing to the government, the committee will not take any decisions regarding giving permission to the proposed project, the final decision will be taken by MOEFCC. He said that first the environmental consultant will give the presentation and thereafter people should raise queries, objections, doubts and the environmental consultant will give a reply. Thereafter, he requested the environmental consultant to give a presentation.

With the permission of Chairman, the technical advisor of the factory Mr. Dr. Subbarao, M/s. Dr. Subbarao Environment Centre, Sangli presented a slide show about the proposed project. It includes project introduction, project description, project location,

general location map, specific location and project boundary map, project layout plan, resource requirements and infrastructure, Power requirement, Water requirement, Factory water requirement and effluent generation, Sugar section -effluent treatment, condensate treatment, Distillery section- condensate treatment, effluent treatment plant, Domestic sewage treatment, Air emission management, Existing and proposed boilers and their Details of control equipment's to be installed for pollution control in the plants, solid waste management, hazardous waste management, air environment, Impact of proposed action on air quality i.e. PM10, PM2.5, SO2, NOx, etc. Regarding scale-up, special diagram of quantity, water analysis and results, report of soil analysis within 10 km radius of the study area, Noise environment, land use pattern in the study area with the photographs of the factory, showing the green space in the factory, budget provision towards environmental management plan, community environmental responsibility plan, rainwater harvesting and stormwater conservation plan, conclusions etc. A photocopy of the presentation is enclosed as Annexure.

After completion of presentation, Hon. Chairman Shri. Sanjay Teli requested the public to raise queries, objections, complaints, suggestions etc. regarding the proposed project and its C.S.R. provisions by mentioning their name and place. The discussion is as below:

1. Shri Kashinath Kallappa Mane, At Channekuppi, Tal: Gadhinglaj, Dist:Kolhapur.

We support the proposed project.

2. Shri Amar Chandrashekhar Zond, A/p-Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

The proposed project is close to Harli villages, the first urgent suggestion is that the capacity of the reservoir which supplies water to Harli Khurd and Harli Budrak villages should be increased in advance, water samples should be taken at this time, water should not be contaminated, increased capacity of the existing water reservoir as the proposed project water requirement will be taken from this area in large quantities & to increase the capacity of existing reservoir will take a time until then, the water supply for the villages should not be reduced, as well as it is suggested that the treated waste water from the factory should not be directly/indirectly mixed with the nearby Hiranyakeshi river. Also,

workers work at high risk so they should get protective equipment accordingly. The proposed project is good, and we appreciate it, so we appreciate and congratulate those who have decided to build the proposed project but take care of safety and make the project successful.

The Dr. Subbarao Environment Centre, Sangli, the technical advisor of the factory of the proposed project said that the wastewater of the proposed project will be treated in three ways & the wastewater of sugar factory will be treated and reused (recycling). Also, he said that the steam water from the condensate polishing unit will be collected, processed, and recycled in the process as well as the wastewater from the distillery project will be concentrated and made into fertilizer powder through a dryer and the proposed expansion project will not take any extra water from outside. Also, there is no reason to worry that the water supply for the villages will decrease in the present situation as the wastewater generated from the factory process will be completely treated and used for the factory, so no additional water is required.

3. Professor Shri P. D. Patil, Factory Member, A/p-Harali Budruk, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

I have been watching for many years the efforts of the Late Mr. Babasaheb Kupekar and the present Hon. Minister Shri. Hasan Mushrif's this area has got an excellent water system. The sugarcane area has increased due to perennial water, so the factory does not require to bring sugarcane from more than the distance of 20 km. Unfortunately, no effort was made to increase the capacity of this factory, so I congratulate the factory management and officials for such current efforts of expansion. If the capacity of the factory is not increased, the future cost of the factory and the salary of the workers will not be able to pay the bills of the farmers, so it is very necessary to increase the capacity of the factory. Also, the by-product of the factory should also be increased and the proposed ethanol project is big perspective of the future of the factory. Therefore, I want everyone to approve the proposed project & secondly, our distillery project is in operation since many years, but the amount of spirit produced from it is very low. So, I request the factory management to increase the capacity of the distillery and take everyone into confidence for the future of the factory as well as to think about how to give the maximum rate to the farmers and dues of the workers. Also, it was requested that the

increasing the capacity of the factory management should think about how to give salary and bonus to Karkhana employees.

4. Shri Shashikant Baburao Chougule, Grampanchayat Member, Harali Khurd, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur.

Since the factory is in Harli Khurd and Harli Budruk villages, the most problems are in these villages as there are 35 houses where adjacent to the storage tank of the molasses due to which smell nuisance existing & the water from the same is entering in the house during the monsoons which cause problems to the children and the elderly peoples, for that planning should be done. Further, he said that the said project should be completed because it is a whole taluka project, so there is no reason to oppose it. The project should be good, but the health of children and the elderly people should be taken care of as well as due spent-wash mixed water the adjacent 35 houses have been completely damaged and affected. In continuation he raised another question is that the carbon and dust will not be released from the proposed project. But in 2011 I wrote a complaint letter to the Maharashtra Pollution Control Board which had not been redressed till 2023, So I request to resolved now as the surrounding villages will suffer a lot. The third thing is that because of the strong smell from the factory, the villagers demand that the flowing wastewater should be underground so that the smell of the polluted water should be stopped. The fourth important issue is that the spent-wash mixed water of the factory goes into the river during the monsoons or when the factory is running and the same water gets mixed in the jackwells at Harli and Gadhinglaj as we are drinking the same water due to which the rate of disease is increasing, so it should be restricted. Also, there are seven farmers downstream of the factory which are applying every year for their compensation due to damage of farmers by spent-wash mixed water going to their fields. So, we should work together to run the project and preserve the glory of the taluk. Keeping in mind the above points, the Karkhana management should help us as well as discuss this matter with us.

The Dr. Subbarao Environment Centre, Sangli, the technical advisor of the factory inform that the entire project will have zero liquid discharge, which means that no wastewater from distillery or sugar factory will go out and it will not be allowed to go out. For that, we are going to spend around Rs. 25 crores in this project. The wastewater

generated will be treated, purified and completely recycled as well as Earlier the generated spent wash was stored for 40 days, 60 days, 90 days, but we proposed to store for 7 days due to which no smell or danger.

5. Shri Rahul Subhash Shirkole, A/p-Mugali, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

First of all I congratulate the factory Chairman, Vice Chairman & the Board of Directors for the proposed expansion project because this factory gets sugarcane geographically from within 20 to 25 km area & earlier only 25 percent of sugarcane cultivation in this area, now 80 to 90 percent of sugarcane is cultivated in this area and the factory is only of 2000 Ton/Day crushing capacity which is the biggest problem to the farmers. So, expansion is the present need as the factories around in other talukas are running at 5000 to 8000 Tons/Day so expansion and ethanol project are necessary. Also, if the people of Harli village are facing any problem, now all the technology is new in proposed project so people will not have any problem of spent wash generated from sugarcane as new and advance technology will be used, so that the environment will not be damaged. The proposed expansion is the future need and should be done.

6. Shri Amar Kallappa Kambale, A/p-Harali Budruk, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

This sugar factory is in both Harli Budruk and Harli Khurd villages. First of all I would like to thank the Board of Directors on behalf of our village regarding the proposed project. In continuation to this he mentions that the wastewater that passes through our village & smoke/ash should be properly disposed of with proper treatment. So, if that is done, we have no objection to the proposed project.

7. Shri Amar Ramchandra Chavan, A/p-Channekuppi, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

I sincerely thank the Board of Directors for coming up with a good concept. The officials have worked to answer the questions raised by the people of Harli. When the factory was established in 1978, a similar program was conducted. But if you look at the problems caused to the people, on the one hand, there is no development without the growth of industry, at the same time, in what way the current industry can pose a threat to the people as well as the people get the things they need while living and what needs to be done for the sustainable development. I request the Maharashtra Pollution Control

Board to consider the fact represented by Mr. Chaugule that the application submitted in the year 2011 was still pending since the last 12-13 years & also M. P. C. Board should keep this fact in mind. Also I have worked as a director of this sugar factory & when I was working here for five years, people from Harli village used to come and say that factory ash comes in their house, the meaning of saying is that sufferer will know the actual facts, so my request to the M. P. C. Board to take the suggestions given by people of Harli village so that the villagers should have faith in proposed development. Also, the officials of the factory said that the land of this sugar factory is 54 hectares & peoples of Harli have said in the statement that the ethanol project is adjacent to our road, so the project should be done here with the convenience of the people and at the same time it will not cause any kind of trouble to the peoples. He also said that the current politics also comes into picture that the farmers used to say that the sugarcane damaged because the spent wash water entered their field for that those who come & complaint get the money and those who don't come don't. My heartfelt thanks to all the Board of Directors for the proposed project, as there is 10 to 12 lakh Tonnes of sugarcane cultivated in the of 20 km surrounding area. So let us help the proposed project to be done, but I would like to believe that the project should be done without any nuisance to the people of the village to whom the land has been given and donated. The most important issue is that the people who depend on Hiranyakeshi river for water in Gadhinglaj Taluka should not beg for water like the people of Ichalkaranji because the water of Panchangga river is polluted.

8. Shri Ramchandra Dhondiba Powar, A/p-Koulage, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

When last time I came to the factory premises, after seeing the premises and inside of the factory, the situation was very pathetic but today at 11 am when I came to the premises and walked around, I am hoping that the factory will restart manufacturing activity, so congratulations to the board of directors of the factory. The Public Hearing panel members said that they are going to take the record of this public hearing and send it to the government as it is, so I request that if the feedback of the environment public hearing committee is to be given they should give the positive feedback for this expansion & if the people of Harli villages are suffering the Karkhana should use advance technology to reduce the pollution but I request to carry out the expansion with the help of new technologies.

9. Sou. Sadhana Aiwale, Sarpanch, Harali Khurd, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

As per the presentation given by the technical expert member of sugar factory there are seven items incorporated for expenditure under the Community Environmental Responsibility Scheme in which item no. 5 is for medical camps & solar energy, so I requested to spend maximum amount to nearby villages. Also, she says that the school & college students of this area will benefit from this project so that the proposed project will benefit both the villages. So proposed expansion is benefited to both the villages & for that congratulates to the Board of Directors.

On that, the chairman of public hearing committee Mr. Sanjay Teli said that the contribution is done by these two villages so the expenditure under CSR fund should be maximum used for development of both these two affected villages. Continuing to this he instructed that the expenditure should be mainly spent more on water, electricity, construction of classrooms in schools and educational equipment for children.

10. Shri Anandrao Dhondiba Powar, A/p-Inchnal, Tal. Gadhinglaj, Dist. Kolhapur

Two things are important to start a factory that has a lot of sugarcane and water for sugarcane, as per the geographical location there is a lot of sugarcane within 20 km area of this factory. Also, Late Shri Babasaheb Kupekar has given water & the proposed expansion project is the need of the future, without which the factory will not be profitable & the members will get money. All the board of Directors and the President of the sugar factory are being appreciated in the Taluka peoples for the decision taken by them regarding the workers of the factory. Also, a good decision has been taken here since 1978 that the workers should honestly get their dues and we have the support of all the workers for the proposed project.

After this Dr. Prakash Shripadrao Shahapurkar, President of M/s. Appasaheb Nalawade Gadhinglaj Taluka S.S.K. Ltd., Harli said that since the year 2003-04 no bank has given loan to this factory. Now the planning is proposed for expansion by considering all objections raised in this public hearing & in past. During the presentation by the technical advisor, it is represented that Water required is 1187 KLPD, but in 1998-99 K.T. Weir was built to facilitate the 2500 KLPD by considering the requirement of factory in the future, so there is no scarcity of water. Also, we are adopting new technology

& it is mandatory to obtain Environmental Clearance from M.P.C. Board as well as in past when I was Chairman the ash from boiler were arrested by installing fly ash arrester and reduced the amount of ash by 99 percent. Today I want to tell the public hearing committee of environment that this is the first distillery in Maharashtra which is erected by M/s. Praj Industries due to which technology was old & there is no such technology-based distillery today in Maharashtra. So due to old technology, I am completely changing it in ethanol project, due to conversion it in to ethanol project it will generate less spent wash as well as generated spent wash will be processed using dryer technology & separate the particles and generated biogas and methane will be used for factory, the remaining generated water in dryer containing 80 to 85 percent potash fertilizer will be produced which will be given to the members. So as a President of the factory, I give 100 percent assurance to you that it is my responsibility to provide you 100 percent clean water and clean air. When I have been the President of the factory the average of 375,000 tons of sugarcane has been crushed during those five years as well as I got approval from Vasantdada Institute for the factory. We have the only distillery in our area which is allowed bio composting so no wastewater will be disturbed, today ethanol production is the lifeline of all sugar industry so capacity building and ethanol production is the need of the hour, the factory has got financial support after twenty years. Also, he assured that there will be no pollution & requested all Members to give good sugar cane for better recovery instead of half raw sugar cane.


Some of the people who were present at the public hearing regarding submitted the written representation. Also, before the public hearing only 02 representations were received through e-mail & hard copy by post which is from Harli Budruk & Harli Khurd, the received presentations again submitted during the public hearing. Copies of written representations received in connection with the proposed project are enclosed.


After this Mr. Pramod R. Mane, Sub-Regional Officer, M.P.C. Board, Kolhapur and the Conveyor of the committee said that the proposed expansion project were permitted only subject to reduce the pollution with the help of advance technology as well as environmental expert committee issued the environmental clearance subject to terms & conditions only and if industry not complied with the terms & conditions the action will be


initiated. Also, on behalf of the M. P. C. Board he assured that the queries from the public will be addressed as soon as possible & action will be initiated if required.

After this Mr. Jagannath S. Salunkhe, Regional Officer, M.P.C. Board, Kolhapur and the member of the committee said that the progress of the industry is the need and the public present have raised good issues in which the main issue is that water sources should remain undisturbed, air pollution should be reduced & the proposed project should be processed in such a way as to introduce new technology. The potash that is going to be produced should be given to all the members at a fair and reasonable price, soil testing should be done regularly & industry should inform new technologies regarding sugarcane seed and CSR fund should be used for good purpose. After all this the factory will progress.

Finally, Hon. Mr. Sanjay Teli, President of the Public Hearing and Additional District Magistrate cum Resident Deputy Collector, Kolhapur, thanks to the peoples of the factory area who were present in this public hearing in large numbers and enthusiastically expressed their views and raised questions as well as cooperated in conducting the public hearing peacefully. He also again requested the attended audience to submit the written representation, if any, and declared that the public hearing meeting is concluded.


(Pramod Mane)
Convener
Environment Public Hearing
Committee
And
Sub Regional Officer, MPCB,
Kolhapur


(Jagannath S. Salunkhe)
Member,
Environment Public Hearing
Committee
And
Regional Officer, MPCB, Kolhapur


(Shri Sanjay Teli)
Chairman,
Environment Public Hearing Committee
And
Additional District Magistrate, Kolhapur, District - Kolhapur